United Nations A/68/969

General Assembly

Distr.: General
1 August 2014

Original: English

Sixty-eighth session
Agenda item 69
Promotion and protection of human rights

Letter dated 1 August 2014 from the Permanent Representative of Uzbekistan to the United Nations addressed to the Secretary-General

I have the honour to convey to you the attached information on the results of the reform of the judicial system in Uzbekistan since independence (see annex).

I would appreciate it if you could circulate the present letter and its annex as a document of the General Assembly under agenda item 69, "Promotion and protection of human rights".

(*Signed*) Muzaffarbek **Madrakhimov**
Permanent Representative

14-59070 (E) 150814 190814

Please recycle

Annex to the letter dated 1 August 2014 from the Permanent Representative of Uzbekistan to the United Nations addressed to the Secretary-General

[Original: Russian]

Results of judicial system reform in Uzbekistan since independence

The main objectives of the judicial reforms in Uzbekistan are to change the substance of the legal and judicial system, to make it the main guarantor of the effective protection of human rights and to ensure the genuine independence of the judiciary. In the years since the country achieved its independence, specific measures in this area have been adopted and are being implemented.

Courts

In order to improve the courts' consideration of cases, specialized criminal, civil and commercial courts have been established in accordance with the Courts Act, as has an appeals process for the consideration of cases.

A citizen who is not in agreement with a verdict handed down by the court of first instance now has the opportunity to defend his or her rights and interests in appellate court or in a court of cassation, using the services of a lawyer. These innovations contribute to the timely correction of errors made by the courts and reduce paperwork.

In connection with the transfer, as of 1 January 2008, of the right to authorize detention (the adoption of habeas corpus) from the prosecutor's office to the courts, the courts' powers to provide effective protection of citizens' rights have been significantly expanded.

The establishment under the aegis of the Supreme Court of a centre for research to democratize and liberalize judicial legislation and ensure the independence of the judiciary promotes the rule of law in the administration of justice and deters interference in the administration of the courts and wrongful judicial decisions.

To strengthen safeguards protecting entrepreneurs, the responsibility for exerting legal leverage on business enterprises, including suspending their activities, freezing bank transactions and enforcing financial sanctions, has been shifted from the oversight bodies to the courts.

Presidential Order No. R-3949, adopted on 29 December 2012, on improving the work of the Presidential High-level Qualifying Commission for the selection and recommendation of judges, under which new regulations on this Commission were approved, facilitated the adoption of urgent measures to radically improve and enhance institutional and legal mechanisms for the selection and training of candidates for judgeships and further ensure genuine independence for the judiciary.

The criminal procedure law has been amended to remove from the authority of the courts the right to initiate criminal proceedings or to announce an indictment in such proceedings, thereby ensuring the objectivity and impartiality of the court and strengthening the adversarial principle in the conduct of criminal cases.

Presidential Decree No. UP-4459 of 2 August 2012 on measures to radically improve social protections for judicial system employees and a presidential decree of 30 November 2012 on institutional measures to further improve the functioning of the judiciary have been important in strengthening the authority of the judiciary and creating an effective judicial staff selection and placement system that is responsive to the needs of democracy today.

Under these decrees:

- The minimum age for a first-time appointment to a judgeship in inter-district or district (municipal) courts has been raised from 25 to 30; five years of legal experience are required; and the professional training requirements have been increased.
- The necessary legal and social guarantees for independent court proceedings have been strengthened, as have protections of the social status of employees in the judiciary.
- Judges' salaries have been increased significantly, and modern information and communications technologies have been integrated into the work of the judiciary.

Also, Cabinet of Ministers Decision No. 346 of 10 December 2012 on measures to integrate modern information and communications technologies into the work of the judiciary was adopted in order to actively integrate modern information and communications technologies into the work of the judiciary and make court proceedings more efficient. The decision is designed to increase computerization and spread the effective use of computer technology, establish information systems and resources in the courts, expand interactive services provided to business enterprises and the public and, most importantly, introduce electronic court proceedings, which are being used successfully in many countries.

The commercial courts now have a mechanism making it possible to generate necessary court documentation electronically. Members of the public can thus file claims with the commercial courts over the Internet.

In addition, the adoption of videoconferencing between commercial courts enables citizens to attend via videoconference, including observing trials and meeting with senior-level commercial court officials. All of this will lead ultimately to more effective oversight of trial activity, as provided for in article 43 of the Courts Act.

Head of State Decree No. UP-570 of 4 October 2013 on measures to improve and enhance the effectiveness of general-jurisdiction district and municipal courts is very important to further improve and enhance the effectiveness of general-jurisdiction courts and to carry out measures to establish appropriate procedures and streamline the courts' workload. The Decree provides for an increase in the number of civil court justices to 71; a redistribution of the number of district courts and courts of equivalent status by transferring 23 judicial posts from courts with a lighter workload; and also modifications to the structure of the Supreme Court.

Liberalization of the penal law

As a result of the work to liberalize the penal and criminal procedural law, the years of independence have seen the following achievements in Uzbekistan:

- The number of crimes considered serious has been reduced, meaning that some crimes previously classified as serious or especially serious have been reclassified as less serious crimes that do not pose a major public danger.

- For certain crimes, alternative, non-custodial forms of punishment have been introduced.

- In criminal matters in the commercial sphere, financial penalties (fines) are now replacing incarceration in a larger number of cases. Confiscation of property as punishment for criminal offences has been discontinued as inhumane.

- As part of judicial and legal reforms, a reconciliation process has been introduced, reflecting features of our national mindset and embodying traits and traditions intrinsic to our people, such as generosity, forbearance and sympathy for those who have committed missteps. Since its introduction, 138,527 cases involving 150,346 persons have resulted in non-custodial penalties. Today in our country, the reconciliation process may be used for 60 different types of crimes.

- The Criminal Code now includes rules on not using custodial penalties in cases where damage has been compensated. This rule, which is consistent with the principles of humanism and generosity, is having the expected outcome. For example, the number of persons incarcerated in 2013 was less than half of the number of persons incarcerated in 2000. In particular, following the adoption of the law on the liberalization of criminal sanctions, more than 26,000 persons, who provided compensation for damage in the amount of 412 billion sum, received non-custodial penalties.

- The Act on amendments to certain legislative acts in connection with the transfer to courts of the right to authorize detention, adopted on 11 July 2007, provided procedural reinforcements for the new mechanism for the courts to apply acts of amnesty at the pretrial phase and while a sentence is being served. The Act on amendments to certain legislative acts in connection with improving the application of acts of amnesty, which entered into force on 23 December 2008, was the logical extension of the gradual transfer to the courts of the protection of the constitutional rights and interests of citizens. This transfer was carried out under presidential supervision.

In connection with the implementation of court procedure to halt criminal proceedings on the basis of an act of amnesty, ways to terminate preliminary investigations referred to in article 372 of the Code of Criminal Procedure include a procedure for handing down a decision to refer a case to court for reconciliation between the parties or the cessation of criminal proceedings under an act of amnesty. Also important is that in accordance with the above-mentioned Act, the Code of Criminal Procedure has been expanded to include chapter 63, entitled "Application of an act of amnesty at the pretrial stage", which consists of five articles comprising entirely new procedures.

This further clarified the process related to procedures for the interrogating or investigating officer to follow when sending materials from a pre-investigation verification or criminal case to the prosecutor; to procedures for the prosecutor to consider requests for application of an act of amnesty; and to submission of petitions to the court on refusal to initiate a criminal case or dismissal of a case.

Procedures related to a court hearing or decision of the court have also been further clarified.

Thus, the application of acts of amnesty has been placed under the authority of an objective body — the court.

In addition, sentencing procedures have been established for cases in which the offender has demonstrated sincere remorse. The adoption of the Act creates real legal guarantees of a more lenient sentence when the offender demonstrates sincere remorse. (The length of the sentence may not exceed two thirds of the maximum penalty provided for in the relevant article of the Special part of the Criminal Code.) The Act will increase rates of crime detection, make investigative activities in the immediate aftermath of a crime more effective and ensure genuine reparations for injury suffered and compensation to the victim for the material damage suffered.

An Act that contains provisions to further strengthen the legal protection of businesses and liberalize the elements of criminal offences was adopted on 29 December 2012. In particular, for certain categories of crimes, the period of time that must elapse for a criminal record to be expunged has been reduced. The threshold for elements of criminal offences, such as the scope of financial damage suffered, has been raised.

In addition, under a new mechanism, criminal cases for certain categories of crimes committed by an employee against a legal entity in which the government is not a shareholder are initiated only by application of an owner or manager or an authorized governing body of the legal entity in question.

Sociopolitical situation and criminality in Uzbekistan

The profound transformation of practice in criminal justice and law enforcement is having a positive impact on the sociopolitical situation and criminality in Uzbekistan.

Another important measure is the complete overhaul of the system of criminal records. When an individual's criminal record is expunged, all the legal ramifications of having such a record are nullified, ensuring much broader protection for the rights and interests of persons who have served their sentences and enabling them to engage in business activities.

Our achievements in guaranteeing the rights and interests of the individual through judicial reform are far-reaching in scale and significance. Of particular importance in this regard is the practice of declaring acts of amnesty, which began in the early years of independence.

Each year, pursuant to articles 80 and 93 of the Constitution, an act of amnesty is adopted under which prisoners are granted a pardon, released from prison and allowed to return to their families. Amnestied persons are also given assistance to help them improve their health and living conditions and find employment.

In the years since Uzbekistan began its independent development, 24 amnesties have been declared.

It should be emphasized that the policy of humanism and generosity has changed for the better the lives of people who have committed crimes through negligence and have shown genuine remorse.

For example, the act of amnesty promulgated in 2012 covered 64,659 persons. A total of 22,193 individuals were pardoned, criminal prosecutions were dropped against 18,285 offenders and 24,181 prisoners had their sentences commuted. The 2013 amnesty covered nearly 70,000 persons, including 3,237 convicts who were released directly from prison.

Abolition of capital punishment

An important step in the liberalization of criminal legislation was the abolition of capital punishment as of 1 January 2008. In addition, the most severe penalty — life imprisonment — applies to only two types of crimes, terrorism and aggravated homicide, both of which may also be punished by alternative, less harsh penalties.

Legal profession

A major priority for further judicial reform aimed at ensuring comprehensive and effective protection of human rights and freedoms is the strengthening of the legal profession.

Article 116 of the Constitution guarantees the right of citizens and organizations to professional legal assistance provided by a lawyer.

In order to continue the reform of the legal profession, a presidential decree was adopted on 1 May 2008 that set out the key points of further reform. The Bar Association of the Republic of Uzbekistan, of which every lawyer in the country is a member, was established as a basic institution of civil society.

On 31 December 2008, an Act aimed at improving the legal profession was adopted. The main achievement of this Act has been to further reform the profession and ensure comprehensive and effective protection of human rights and freedoms by giving citizens access to qualified legal assistance.

In order to implement article 116 of the Constitution, a statute was enacted on 15 September 2008 under which lawyers are the only persons allowed to serve as defence counsel in criminal cases. At the request of an individual who is suspected, under indictment or on trial, counsel may be accompanied by a close relative or legal representative of that individual.

Moreover, on 11 September 2009 an act was adopted under which lawyers are the only persons who may represent parties to civil cases in the courts.

The purpose of these rules is to prevent persons who lack legal expertise from participating as counsel in court proceedings and to improve the quality of legal assistance provided to citizens.

Enforcement of judgements

An important and integral element of justice is the enforcement of judicial decisions.

In recent years, Uzbekistan has implemented a number of measures to ensure more efficient enforcement of judgements. The system of the Department for the Enforcement of Judicial Decisions and Logistics and Financial Support of Judicial Activities in the Ministry of Justice of the Republic of Uzbekistan has been substantially transformed; legislation on enforcement of the decisions of courts and

other bodies has been enhanced; and stricter liability for failure to enforce judicial decisions and obstruction of enforcement has been introduced.

The Act on Enforcement of the Decisions of Courts and Other Bodies established a system for enforcement of the decisions of courts and other bodies, set out the procedure and special circumstances for their enforcement, and strengthened the status of bailiffs and provided for legal safeguards for their activities.

On 14 January 2009 an act was adopted that amended several statutes of the Republic of Uzbekistan on improvement of the enforcement process. The act provides for greater accountability for the enforcement of judicial decisions; the establishment of an effective system for the prevention, detection and suppression of crime; strengthening of the organizational and legal framework for the activities of the Judicial Department; and enhanced status for bailiffs.

With respect to giving the Judicial Department investigative functions for cases within its jurisdiction, investigative and administrative units were established by Presidential Decree No. PP-1900 of 29 December 2012 on measures to further improve the activities of the Department for the Enforcement of Judicial Decisions and Logistics and Financial Support of Judicial Activities in the Ministry of Justice.

Policy outline on further strengthening of democratic reforms and development of civil society in Uzbekistan

In a statement to a joint session of the houses of parliament on 12 November 2010, President Islam Karimov put forward a series of legislative initiatives also aimed at further reform of the judicial system.

Their key components are the following:

1. Strengthened judicial oversight of preliminary investigations and inquiries and expanded application of habeas corpus in criminal proceedings, meaning that the power to take certain procedural coercive measures (dismissal from work and placing a person in a medical institution) at the pretrial stage is transferred from the prosecutor's office to the courts. The Act required to carry out these measures was adopted on 18 September 2012.

2. Adoption of the Investigations Act. It should be noted that the Investigations Act adopted on 25 December 2012 defines the concept of investigation; sets out the tasks, principles, forms and methods of investigation; stipulates the agencies responsible for investigations and delimits their authority, rights and duties; and indicates the types of investigative activities allowed and the procedure for conducting them. The Act also enshrines social and legal protections for the personnel of investigative agencies and for individuals assisting with investigations and their family members.

3. Adoption of an act on internal affairs agencies governing the legal status of internal affairs agencies and their personnel. The law will set forth the basic tasks, functions, rights and duties of internal affairs agencies and strengthen social protection for internal affairs personnel.

4. Adoption of an act providing for further mechanisms of judicial protection for businesses, including in their relations with government agencies. On 14 May 2014, an act was adopted that further strengthens judicial protections for businesses in a number of areas:

- The Code of Commercial Procedure was amended to provide, among other things, that the commercial court also has jurisdiction in disputes involving persons who have lost the status of individual owner but who meet the relevant requirements as a result of their previous business activities;

- A provision was added to the Act on State Control of Business Activity whereby the filing of a complaint in court entails suspension of the action or decision that is the subject of the complaint, except for actions or decisions aimed at preventing disasters, epidemics or other real threats to human life or health, until such time as a court decision enters into force.

5. Adoption of an amended Code of Administrative Liability to replace the Code in effect since 1994. The Code will be based on the trend towards decriminalization in penal law. Certain offences will be moved from criminal to administrative jurisdiction and the law will provide for measures to enhance and democratize the procedural mechanisms for the handling of administrative cases. This document will further extend the rule of law and the protection of individual rights in the area of administrative law.

Achieving the goals set out in the policy outline will strengthen judicial protections for the rights, freedoms and legitimate interests of citizens. The successful implementation of all the judicial reforms outlined will be not only the outcome of democratization and liberalization of the society and the State but also a guarantee of their continuation, enabling Uzbekistan to move further along the path "from a strong State to a strong civil society".

On the whole, the democratization reforms that have been carried out have helped to strengthen judicial protections for individuals, enhance the role of lawyers, and accelerate the processes of democratization, social renewal, reform and modernization of the country.

United Nations A/68/970

General Assembly

Distr.: General
12 August 2014

Original: English

Sixty-eighth session
Agenda items 14, 19 (a) and 118

Integrated and coordinated implementation of and follow-up to the outcomes of the major United Nations conferences and summits in the economic, social and related fields

Sustainable development: implementation of Agenda 21, the Programme for the Further Implementation of Agenda 21 and the outcomes of the World Summit on Sustainable Development and of the United Nations Conference on Sustainable Development

Follow-up to the outcome of the Millennium Summit

Report of the Open Working Group of the General Assembly on Sustainable Development Goals

I. Letter of transmittal dated 1 August 2014 from the Permanent Representatives of Hungary and Kenya to the United Nations addressed to the President of the General Assembly

In our capacity as Co-Chairs of the Open Working Group of the General Assembly on Sustainable Development Goals, further to the progress report submitted on 23 July 2013 (A/67/941) and pursuant to paragraph 248 of the outcome document of the United Nations Conference on Sustainable Development, entitled "The future we want" (resolution 66/288, annex), as agreed by the Open Working Group by acclamation at the 2nd meeting of its thirteenth session, on 19 July 2014, we have the honour to submit herewith the proposal of the Open Working Group on sustainable development goals, for consideration and appropriate action by the General Assembly.

We also attach hereto a record of the proceedings of the Open Working Group at its first to thirteenth sessions, including reference to the statements made at the closing meeting, on 19 July, and those subsequently submitted in writing. Taken together, the proposal on sustainable development goals and the record of proceedings constitute the report of the Open Working Group to the General Assembly.

14-59106 (E) 090914

Please recycle

We kindly request that the present letter and the annexes hereto[1] be issued as a document of the General Assembly under the appropriate agenda items.

We recommend that the General Assembly at its sixty-eighth session forward the proposal of the Open Working Group, as contained in annex I to the present letter, to the General Assembly at its sixty-ninth session for consideration and appropriate action in the context of the post-2015 development agenda.

(*Signed*) Csaba **Kőrösi**
Permanent Representative
Hungary

(*Signed*) Macharia **Kamau**
Permanent Representative
Kenya

[1] The letter from the Co-Chairs of the Open Working Group and the annexes thereto were circulated by the President of the General Assembly in his letter dated 4 August 2014 (available from http://www.un.org/en/ga/president/68/pdf/letters/08042014_OWG%20Sustainable%20Goals.pdf).

II. Introduction

1. In its resolution 66/288, the General Assembly endorsed the outcome document of the United Nations Conference on Sustainable Development, entitled "The future we want", annexed to the resolution. Paragraph 248 of the said outcome document read as follows:

> "248. We resolve to establish an inclusive and transparent intergovernmental process on sustainable development goals that is open to all stakeholders, with a view to developing global sustainable development goals to be agreed by the General Assembly. An open working group shall be constituted no later than at the opening of the sixty-seventh session of the Assembly and shall comprise 30 representatives, nominated by Member States from the five United Nations regional groups, with the aim of achieving fair, equitable and balanced geographical representation. At the outset, this open working group will decide on its methods of work, including developing modalities to ensure the full involvement of relevant stakeholders and expertise from civil society, the scientific community and the United Nations system in its work, in order to provide a diversity of perspectives and experience. It will submit a report, to the Assembly at its sixty-eighth session, containing a proposal for sustainable development goals for consideration and appropriate action."

2. In its resolution 67/203, the General Assembly recalled paragraphs 245 to 251 of the outcome document and reiterated that the Open Working Group would submit its report at the sixty-eighth session.

3. In its decision 67/555, the General Assembly welcomed the membership of the Open Working Group as designated by the five United Nations regional groups and as listed in the annex to the decision.

III. Organizational matters

A. Organization of work

4. Sessions were held as follows: first session (14 and 15 March 2013, four formal meetings); second session (17-19 April 2013, six formal meetings); third session (22-24 May 2013, six formal meetings); fourth session (17-19 June 2013, six formal meetings); fifth session (25-27 November 2013, six formal meetings); sixth session (9-13 December 2013, nine formal meetings); seventh session (6-10 January 2014, nine formal meetings); eighth session (3-7 February 2014, 10 formal meetings); ninth session (3-5 March 2014, five formal meetings, including a joint meeting on 5 March 2014 with the Intergovernmental Committee of Experts on Financing for Sustainable Development); tenth session (31 March-4 April 2014, 10 formal meetings); eleventh session (5-9 May 2014, 10 formal meetings); twelfth session (16-20 June 2014, two formal meetings and informal meetings); and thirteenth session (14-19 July 2014, two formal meetings and informal meetings).

B. Opening

5. On 14 March 2013, the President of the sixty-seventh session of the General Assembly opened the first session of the Open Working Group. Statements were made by the President and the Secretary-General.

C. Election of officers

6. At the 1st meeting of its first session, on 14 March 2013, the Open Working Group elected Csaba Kőrösi (Hungary) and Macharia Kamau (Kenya) as its Co-Chairs by acclamation.

D. Agenda

7. At the same meeting, the Open Working Group adopted the provisional agenda (A/AC.280/2013/1), which read:

1. Election of officers.
2. Adoption of the agenda and other organizational matters.
3. Follow-up to the outcome of the United Nations Conference on Sustainable Development, relating to a proposal for sustainable development goals.
4. Other matters.
5. Adoption of the report.

E. Methods of work

8. At the same meeting, the Open Working Group adopted its methods of work.[2]

F. Proceedings of the Open Working Group

9. At its first session, on 14 and 15 March 2013, the Open Working Group heard the introduction by the Secretariat of the initial input of the Secretary-General to the Open Working Group (A/67/634) and conducted a general discussion and an interactive discussion on the sustainable development goals.

10. At its second to eighth sessions, the Open Working Group, through keynote addresses, introductions of issues notes by the United Nations Technical Support Team, panel discussions and interactive exchanges of views, and national statements, considered the following subjects:

(a) Second session (17-19 April 2013):

(i) Conceptualizing the sustainable development goals;

(ii) Poverty eradication;

(b) Third session (22-24 May 2013):

(i) Food security and nutrition, sustainable agriculture, desertification, land degradation and drought;

(ii) Water and sanitation;

(c) Fourth session (17-19 June 2013):

(i) Employment and decent work for all, social protection, youth, education and culture;

[2] See http://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/content/documents/1692OWG_methods_work_adopted_1403.pdf.

(ii) Health, population dynamics;

(d) Fifth session (25-27 November 2013):

(i) Sustained and inclusive economic growth, macroeconomic policy questions (including international trade, international financial system and external debt sustainability), infrastructure development and industrialization;

(ii) Energy;

(e) Sixth session (9-13 December 2013):

(i) Means of implementation (finance, science and technology, knowledge-sharing and capacity-building);

(ii) Global partnership for achieving sustainable development;

(iii) Needs of countries in special situations, African countries, least developed countries, landlocked developed countries and small island developing States, in addition to specific challenges facing the middle-income countries;

(iv) Human rights, the right to development, global governance;

(f) Seventh session (6-10 January 2014):

(i) Sustainable cities and human settlements, sustainable transport;

(ii) Sustainable consumption and production (including chemicals and waste);

(iii) Climate change and disaster risk reduction;

(g) Eighth session (3-7 February 2014):

(i) Oceans and seas, forests, biodiversity;

(ii) Promoting equality, including social equity, gender equality and women's empowerment;

(iii) Conflict prevention, post-conflict peacebuilding and promotion of durable peace, rule of law and governance.

11. At its ninth to thirteenth sessions, the Open Working Group held discussions on a proposal on sustainable development goals.

G. Proposal on sustainable development goals

12. At the 2nd meeting of its thirteenth session, on 19 July, under item 3 of the agenda, the Open Working Group considered a proposal on sustainable development goals.

13. At the same meeting, statements, including explanations of position, and reservations, were made by the representatives of Nigeria, the Islamic Republic of Iran, the Syrian Arab Republic, Uganda, Honduras, Switzerland (also on behalf of France and Germany), the Russian Federation, Denmark (also on behalf of Ireland and Norway), the Bolivarian Republic of Venezuela, Chad, Saudi Arabia, Iceland, Egypt, the European Union, the Sudan, Pakistan, Spain (also on behalf of Italy), the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland (also on behalf of Australia

and the Netherlands), the United Arab Emirates, the United States of America, the Plurinational State of Bolivia (on behalf of the Group of 77 and China), Cuba, Ecuador (also on behalf of the Plurinational State of Bolivia, then in a national capacity), Canada, Japan, China, Sweden, Mexico (also on behalf of Peru, then in a national capacity), the United Republic of Tanzania, the Republic of Korea, Liechtenstein, Djibouti, Indonesia, Brazil (also on behalf of Nicaragua), Timor-Leste (also on behalf of Liberia and Sierra Leone), Tunisia, Trinidad and Tobago (on behalf of the Caribbean Community), Benin (on behalf of the least developed countries), Montenegro (also on behalf of Slovenia), Palau, Ethiopia, India, Uruguay, Colombia, Argentina (also on behalf of the Plurinational State of Bolivia and Ecuador) and Romania (also on behalf of Poland). Subsequently, statements, including explanations of position, and reservations, were also submitted in writing by Algeria, Australia, Bolivia (Plurinational State of), Chad, Colombia, Cyprus, Ecuador, Egypt, France, Germany, Greece, Honduras, Iceland, Japan, Mexico, Morocco, the Netherlands, Nigeria, Papua New Guinea (on behalf of the Pacific small island developing States and Timor-Leste), Peru, Poland, Romania, Qatar, Saudi Arabia, Singapore, the Sudan, Switzerland, Tunisia, the United Arab Emirates, the United Kingdom, the United Republic of Tanzania, the United States, Venezuela (Bolivarian Republic of), Yemen, the Holy See and the Caribbean Community.[3]

14. Also at the same meeting, pursuant to paragraph 248 of the outcome document of the United Nations Conference on Sustainable Development, the Open Working Group agreed by acclamation to submit its proposal on sustainable development goals to the General Assembly at its sixty-eighth session for consideration and appropriate action.

IV. Proposal of the Open Working Group on sustainable development goals

Introduction

1. The outcome document of the United Nations Conference on Sustainable Development, entitled "The future we want", inter alia, set out a mandate to establish an open working group to develop a set of sustainable development goals for consideration and appropriate action by the General Assembly at its sixty-eighth session. It also provided the basis for their conceptualization. The document gave the mandate that the sustainable development goals should be coherent with and integrated into the United Nations development agenda beyond 2015.

2. Poverty eradication is the greatest global challenge facing the world today and an indispensable requirement for sustainable development. In the outcome document, the commitment to freeing humanity from poverty and hunger as a matter of urgency was reiterated.

3. Poverty eradication, changing unsustainable and promoting sustainable patterns of consumption and production and protecting and managing the natural resource base of economic and social development are the overarching objectives of and essential requirements for sustainable development.

[3] Available, where provided, from http://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/owg13.html.

4. People are at the centre of sustainable development and, in this regard, in the outcome document, the promise was made to strive for a world that is just, equitable and inclusive and the commitment was made to work together to promote sustained and inclusive economic growth, social development and environmental protection and thereby to benefit all, in particular the children of the world, youth and future generations of the world, without distinction of any kind such as age, sex, disability, culture, race, ethnicity, origin, migratory status, religion, economic or other status.

5. In the outcome document, all the principles of the Rio Declaration on Environment and Development, including, inter alia, the principle of common but differentiated responsibilities, as set out in principle 7 thereof, were also reaffirmed.

6. In the outcome document, the commitment to fully implement the Rio Declaration, Agenda 21, the Programme for the Further Implementation of Agenda 21, the Plan of Implementation of the World Summit on Sustainable Development (Johannesburg Plan of Implementation) and the Johannesburg Declaration on Sustainable Development, the Programme of Action for the Sustainable Development of Small Island Developing States (Barbados Programme of Action) and the Mauritius Strategy for the Further Implementation of the Programme of Action for the Sustainable Development of Small Island Developing States was also reaffirmed. The commitment to the full implementation of the Programme of Action for the Least Developed Countries for the Decade 2011-2020 (Istanbul Programme of Action), the Almaty Programme of Action: Addressing the Special Needs of Landlocked Developing Countries within a New Global Framework for Transit Transport Cooperation for Landlocked and Transit Developing Countries, the political declaration on Africa's development needs and the New Partnership for Africa's Development was also reaffirmed. The commitments in the outcomes of all the major United Nations conferences and summits in the economic, social and environmental fields, including the United Nations Millennium Declaration, the 2005 World Summit Outcome, the Monterrey Consensus of the International Conference on Financing for Development, the Doha Declaration on Financing for Development, the outcome document of the high-level plenary meeting of the General Assembly on the Millennium Development Goals, the Programme of Action of the International Conference on Population and Development, the key actions for the further implementation of the Programme of Action of the International Conference on Population and Development and the Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action and the outcome documents of their review conferences were reaffirmed. In the outcome document of the special event to follow up efforts made towards achieving the Millennium Development Goals, held in September 2013, inter alia, the determination to craft a strong post-2015 development agenda was reaffirmed. The commitment to migration and development was reaffirmed in the Declaration of the High-level Dialogue on International Migration and Development.

7. In the outcome document, the need to be guided by the purposes and principles of the Charter of the United Nations, with full respect for international law and its principles, was reaffirmed. The importance of freedom, peace and security, respect for all human rights, including the right to development and the right to an adequate standard of living, including the right to food and water, the rule of law, good governance, gender equality, women's empowerment and the overall commitment to just and democratic societies for development was reaffirmed. The importance of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, as well as other international instruments relating to human rights and international law, was also reaffirmed.

8. The Open Working Group underscored that the global nature of climate change calls for the widest possible cooperation by all countries and their participation in an effective and appropriate international response, with a view to accelerating the reduction of global greenhouse gas emissions. It recalled that the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change provides that parties should protect the climate system for the benefit of present and future generations of humankind on the basis of equity and in accordance with their common but differentiated responsibilities and respective capabilities. It noted with grave concern the significant gap between the aggregate effect of mitigation pledges by parties in terms of global annual emissions of greenhouse gases by 2020 and aggregate emission pathways consistent with having a likely chance of holding the increase in global average temperature below 2°C, or 1.5°C above pre-industrial levels. It reaffirmed that the ultimate objective under the Convention is to stabilize greenhouse gas concentrations in the atmosphere at a level that would prevent dangerous anthropogenic interference with the climate system.

9. In the outcome document of the United Nations Conference on Sustainable Development, it was reaffirmed that planet Earth and its ecosystems are our home and that "Mother Earth" is a common expression in a number of countries and regions. It was noted that some countries recognize the rights of nature in the context of the promotion of sustainable development. The conviction was affirmed that, in order to achieve a just balance among the economic, social and environmental needs of present and future generations, it is necessary to promote harmony with nature. The natural and cultural diversity of the world was acknowledged, and it was recognized that all cultures and civilizations can contribute to sustainable development.

10. In the outcome document, it was recognized that each country faces specific challenges to achieve sustainable development. The special challenges facing the most vulnerable countries and, in particular, African countries, least developed countries, landlocked developing countries and small island developing States, as well as the specific challenges facing the middle-income countries, were underscored. It was recognized that countries in situations of conflict also need special attention.

11. In the outcome document, the commitment to strengthen international cooperation to address the persistent challenges related to sustainable development for all, in particular in developing countries, was reaffirmed. In that regard, the need to achieve economic stability, sustained economic growth, the promotion of social equity and the protection of the environment, while enhancing gender equality, women's empowerment and equal employment for all, and the protection, survival and development of children to their full potential, including through education, was reaffirmed.

12. Each country has primary responsibility for its own economic and social development and the role of national policies, domestic resources and development strategies cannot be overemphasized. Developing countries need additional resources for sustainable development. There is a need for significant mobilization of resources from a variety of sources and the effective use of financing, in order to promote sustainable development. In the outcome document, the commitment to reinvigorating the global partnership for sustainable development and to mobilizing the resources necessary for its implementation was affirmed. The report of the Intergovernmental Committee of Experts on Sustainable Development Financing will propose options for a sustainable development financing strategy. The

substantive outcome of the third International Conference on Financing for Development, in July 2015, will assess the progress made in the implementation of the Monterrey Consensus and the Doha Declaration. Good governance and the rule of law at the national and international levels are essential for sustained, inclusive and equitable economic growth, sustainable development and the eradication of poverty and hunger.

13. In the outcome document, it was reaffirmed that there are different approaches, visions, models and tools available to each country, in accordance with its national circumstances and priorities, to achieve sustainable development in its three dimensions, which is our overarching goal.

14. The implementation of the sustainable development goals will depend on a global partnership for sustainable development with the active engagement of Governments, as well as civil society, the private sector and the United Nations system. A robust mechanism to review implementation will be essential for the success of the goals. The General Assembly, the Economic and Social Council and the high-level political forum will play a key role in this regard.

15. In the outcome document, the commitment was reiterated to take further effective measures and actions, in conformity with international law, to remove the obstacles to the full realization of the right of self-determination of peoples living under colonial and foreign occupation, which continue to adversely affect their economic and social development as well as their environment, are incompatible with the dignity and worth of the human person and must be combated and eliminated.

16. In the outcome document, it was reaffirmed that, in accordance with the Charter, this shall not be construed as authorizing or encouraging any action against the territorial integrity or political independence of any State. It was resolved to take further effective measures and actions, in conformity with international law, to remove obstacles and constraints, strengthen support and meet the special needs of people living in areas affected by complex humanitarian emergencies and in areas affected by terrorism.

17. To monitor the implementation of the sustainable development goals, it will be important to improve the availability of and access to data and statistics disaggregated by income, gender, age, race, ethnicity, migratory status, disability, geographic location and other characteristics relevant in national contexts. There is a need to take urgent steps to improve the quality, coverage and availability of disaggregated data to ensure that no one is left behind.

18. The sustainable development goals are accompanied by targets and will be further elaborated through indicators focused on measurable outcomes. They are action oriented, global in nature and universally applicable. They take into account different national realities, capacities and levels of development and respect national policies and priorities. They build on the foundation laid by the Millennium Development Goals, seek to complete the unfinished business of the Millennium Development Goals and respond to new challenges. They constitute an integrated, indivisible set of global priorities for sustainable development. Targets are defined as aspirational global targets, with each Government setting its own national targets guided by the global level of ambition, but taking into account national circumstances. The goals and targets integrate economic, social and environmental aspects and recognize their interlinkages in achieving sustainable development in all its dimensions.

Sustainable development goals

Goal 1. End poverty in all its forms everywhere

Goal 2. End hunger, achieve food security and improved nutrition and promote sustainable agriculture

Goal 3. Ensure healthy lives and promote well-being for all at all ages

Goal 4. Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all

Goal 5. Achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls

Goal 6. Ensure availability and sustainable management of water and sanitation for all

Goal 7. Ensure access to affordable, reliable, sustainable and modern energy for all

Goal 8. Promote sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic growth, full and productive employment and decent work for all

Goal 9. Build resilient infrastructure, promote inclusive and sustainable industrialization and foster innovation

Goal 10. Reduce inequality within and among countries

Goal 11. Make cities and human settlements inclusive, safe, resilient and sustainable

Goal 12. Ensure sustainable consumption and production patterns

Goal 13. Take urgent action to combat climate change and its impacts*

* Acknowledging that the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change is the primary international, intergovernmental forum for negotiating the global response to climate change.

Goal 14. Conserve and sustainably use the oceans, seas and marine resources for sustainable development

Goal 15. Protect, restore and promote sustainable use of terrestrial ecosystems, sustainably manage forests, combat desertification, and halt and reverse land degradation and halt biodiversity loss

Goal 16. Promote peaceful and inclusive societies for sustainable development, provide access to justice for all and build effective, accountable and inclusive institutions at all levels

Goal 17. Strengthen the means of implementation and revitalize the global partnership for sustainable development

Sustainable development goals and targets

Goal 1. End poverty in all its forms everywhere

1.1 By 2030, eradicate extreme poverty for all people everywhere, currently measured as people living on less than $1.25 a day

1.2 By 2030, reduce at least by half the proportion of men, women and children of all ages living in poverty in all its dimensions according to national definitions

1.3 Implement nationally appropriate social protection systems and measures for all, including floors, and by 2030 achieve substantial coverage of the poor and the vulnerable

1.4 By 2030, ensure that all men and women, in particular the poor and the vulnerable, have equal rights to economic resources, as well as access to basic services, ownership and control over land and other forms of property, inheritance, natural resources, appropriate new technology and financial services, including microfinance

1.5 By 2030, build the resilience of the poor and those in vulnerable situations and reduce their exposure and vulnerability to climate-related extreme events and other economic, social and environmental shocks and disasters

1.a Ensure significant mobilization of resources from a variety of sources, including through enhanced development cooperation, in order to provide adequate and predictable means for developing countries, in particular least developed countries, to implement programmes and policies to end poverty in all its dimensions

1.b Create sound policy frameworks at the national, regional and international levels, based on pro-poor and gender-sensitive development strategies, to support accelerated investment in poverty eradication actions

Goal 2. End hunger, achieve food security and improved nutrition and promote sustainable agriculture

2.1 By 2030, end hunger and ensure access by all people, in particular the poor and people in vulnerable situations, including infants, to safe, nutritious and sufficient food all year round

2.2 By 2030, end all forms of malnutrition, including achieving, by 2025, the internationally agreed targets on stunting and wasting in children under 5 years of age, and address the nutritional needs of adolescent girls, pregnant and lactating women and older persons

2.3 By 2030, double the agricultural productivity and incomes of small-scale food producers, in particular women, indigenous peoples, family farmers, pastoralists and fishers, including through secure and equal access to land, other productive resources and inputs, knowledge, financial services, markets and opportunities for value addition and non-farm employment

2.4 By 2030, ensure sustainable food production systems and implement resilient agricultural practices that increase productivity and production, that help maintain ecosystems, that strengthen capacity for adaptation to climate change, extreme

weather, drought, flooding and other disasters and that progressively improve land and soil quality

2.5 By 2020, maintain the genetic diversity of seeds, cultivated plants and farmed and domesticated animals and their related wild species, including through soundly managed and diversified seed and plant banks at the national, regional and international levels, and ensure access to and fair and equitable sharing of benefits arising from the utilization of genetic resources and associated traditional knowledge, as internationally agreed

2.a Increase investment, including through enhanced international cooperation, in rural infrastructure, agricultural research and extension services, technology development and plant and livestock gene banks in order to enhance agricultural productive capacity in developing countries, in particular least developed countries

2.b Correct and prevent trade restrictions and distortions in world agricultural markets, including through the parallel elimination of all forms of agricultural export subsidies and all export measures with equivalent effect, in accordance with the mandate of the Doha Development Round

2.c Adopt measures to ensure the proper functioning of food commodity markets and their derivatives and facilitate timely access to market information, including on food reserves, in order to help limit extreme food price volatility

Goal 3. Ensure healthy lives and promote well-being for all at all ages

3.1 By 2030, reduce the global maternal mortality ratio to less than 70 per 100,000 live births

3.2 By 2030, end preventable deaths of newborns and children under 5 years of age

3.3 By 2030, end the epidemics of AIDS, tuberculosis, malaria and neglected tropical diseases and combat hepatitis, water-borne diseases and other communicable diseases

3.4 By 2030, reduce by one third premature mortality from non-communicable diseases through prevention and treatment and promote mental health and well-being

3.5 Strengthen the prevention and treatment of substance abuse, including narcotic drug abuse and harmful use of alcohol

3.6 By 2020, halve the number of global deaths and injuries from road traffic accidents

3.7 By 2030, ensure universal access to sexual and reproductive health-care services, including for family planning, information and education, and the integration of reproductive health into national strategies and programmes

3.8 Achieve universal health coverage, including financial risk protection, access to quality essential health-care services and access to safe, effective, quality and affordable essential medicines and vaccines for all

3.9 By 2030, substantially reduce the number of deaths and illnesses from hazardous chemicals and air, water and soil pollution and contamination

3.a Strengthen the implementation of the World Health Organization Framework Convention on Tobacco Control in all countries, as appropriate

3.b Support the research and development of vaccines and medicines for the communicable and non-communicable diseases that primarily affect developing countries, provide access to affordable essential medicines and vaccines, in accordance with the Doha Declaration on the TRIPS Agreement and Public Health, which affirms the right of developing countries to use to the full the provisions in the Agreement on Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights regarding flexibilities to protect public health, and, in particular, provide access to medicines for all

3.c Substantially increase health financing and the recruitment, development, training and retention of the health workforce in developing countries, especially in least developed countries and small island developing States

3.d Strengthen the capacity of all countries, in particular developing countries, for early warning, risk reduction and management of national and global health risks

Goal 4. Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all

4.1 By 2030, ensure that all girls and boys complete free, equitable and quality primary and secondary education leading to relevant and effective learning outcomes

4.2 By 2030, ensure that all girls and boys have access to quality early childhood development, care and pre-primary education so that they are ready for primary education

4.3 By 2030, ensure equal access for all women and men to affordable and quality technical, vocational and tertiary education, including university

4.4 By 2030, increase by [x] per cent the number of youth and adults who have relevant skills, including technical and vocational skills, for employment, decent jobs and entrepreneurship

4.5 By 2030, eliminate gender disparities in education and ensure equal access to all levels of education and vocational training for the vulnerable, including persons with disabilities, indigenous peoples and children in vulnerable situations

4.6 By 2030, ensure that all youth and at least [x] per cent of adults, both men and women, achieve literacy and numeracy

4.7 By 2030, ensure that all learners acquire the knowledge and skills needed to promote sustainable development, including, among others, through education for sustainable development and sustainable lifestyles, human rights, gender equality, promotion of a culture of peace and non-violence, global citizenship and appreciation of cultural diversity and of culture's contribution to sustainable development

4.a Build and upgrade education facilities that are child, disability and gender sensitive and provide safe, non-violent, inclusive and effective learning environments for all

4.b By 2020, expand by [x] per cent globally the number of scholarships available to developing countries, in particular least developed countries, small island developing States and African countries, for enrolment in higher education, including vocational training and information and communications technology, technical, engineering and scientific programmes, in developed countries and other developing countries

4.c By 2030, increase by [x] per cent the supply of qualified teachers, including through international cooperation for teacher training in developing countries, especially least developed countries and small island developing States

Goal 5. Achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls

5.1 End all forms of discrimination against all women and girls everywhere

5.2 Eliminate all forms of violence against all women and girls in the public and private spheres, including trafficking and sexual and other types of exploitation

5.3 Eliminate all harmful practices, such as child, early and forced marriage and female genital mutilation

5.4 Recognize and value unpaid care and domestic work through the provision of public services, infrastructure and social protection policies and the promotion of shared responsibility within the household and the family as nationally appropriate

5.5 Ensure women's full and effective participation and equal opportunities for leadership at all levels of decision-making in political, economic and public life

5.6 Ensure universal access to sexual and reproductive health and reproductive rights as agreed in accordance with the Programme of Action of the International Conference on Population and Development and the Beijing Platform for Action and the outcome documents of their review conferences

5.a Undertake reforms to give women equal rights to economic resources, as well as access to ownership and control over land and other forms of property, financial services, inheritance and natural resources, in accordance with national laws

5.b Enhance the use of enabling technology, in particular information and communications technology, to promote the empowerment of women

5.c Adopt and strengthen sound policies and enforceable legislation for the promotion of gender equality and the empowerment of all women and girls at all levels

Goal 6. Ensure availability and sustainable management of water and sanitation for all

6.1 By 2030, achieve universal and equitable access to safe and affordable drinking water for all

6.2 By 2030, achieve access to adequate and equitable sanitation and hygiene for all and end open defecation, paying special attention to the needs of women and girls and those in vulnerable situations

6.3 By 2030, improve water quality by reducing pollution, eliminating dumping and minimizing release of hazardous chemicals and materials, halving the

proportion of untreated wastewater and increasing recycling and safe reuse by [x] per cent globally

6.4 By 2030, substantially increase water-use efficiency across all sectors and ensure sustainable withdrawals and supply of freshwater to address water scarcity and substantially reduce the number of people suffering from water scarcity

6.5 By 2030, implement integrated water resources management at all levels, including through transboundary cooperation as appropriate

6.6 By 2020, protect and restore water-related ecosystems, including mountains, forests, wetlands, rivers, aquifers and lakes

6.a By 2030, expand international cooperation and capacity-building support to developing countries in water- and sanitation-related activities and programmes, including water harvesting, desalination, water efficiency, wastewater treatment, recycling and reuse technologies

6.b Support and strengthen the participation of local communities in improving water and sanitation management

Goal 7. Ensure access to affordable, reliable, sustainable and modern energy for all

7.1 By 2030, ensure universal access to affordable, reliable and modern energy services

7.2 By 2030, increase substantially the share of renewable energy in the global energy mix

7.3 By 2030, double the global rate of improvement in energy efficiency

7.a By 2030, enhance international cooperation to facilitate access to clean energy research and technology, including renewable energy, energy efficiency and advanced and cleaner fossil-fuel technology, and promote investment in energy infrastructure and clean energy technology

7.b By 2030, expand infrastructure and upgrade technology for supplying modern and sustainable energy services for all in developing countries, in particular least developed countries and small island developing States

Goal 8. Promote sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic growth, full and productive employment and decent work for all

8.1 Sustain per capita economic growth in accordance with national circumstances and, in particular, at least 7 per cent gross domestic product growth per annum in the least developed countries

8.2 Achieve higher levels of economic productivity through diversification, technological upgrading and innovation, including through a focus on high-value-added and labour-intensive sectors

8.3 Promote development-oriented policies that support productive activities, decent job creation, entrepreneurship, creativity and innovation, and encourage the

formalization and growth of micro-, small- and medium-sized enterprises, including through access to financial services

8.4 Improve progressively, through 2030, global resource efficiency in consumption and production and endeavour to decouple economic growth from environmental degradation, in accordance with the 10-year framework of programmes on sustainable consumption and production, with developed countries taking the lead

8.5 By 2030, achieve full and productive employment and decent work for all women and men, including for young people and persons with disabilities, and equal pay for work of equal value

8.6 By 2020, substantially reduce the proportion of youth not in employment, education or training

8.7 Take immediate and effective measures to secure the prohibition and elimination of the worst forms of child labour, eradicate forced labour and, by 2025, end child labour in all its forms, including the recruitment and use of child soldiers

8.8 Protect labour rights and promote safe and secure working environments for all workers, including migrant workers, in particular women migrants, and those in precarious employment

8.9 By 2030, devise and implement policies to promote sustainable tourism that creates jobs and promotes local culture and products

8.10 Strengthen the capacity of domestic financial institutions to encourage and expand access to banking, insurance and financial services for all

8.a Increase Aid for Trade support for developing countries, in particular least developed countries, including through the Enhanced Integrated Framework for Trade-Related Technical Assistance to Least Developed Countries

8.b By 2020, develop and operationalize a global strategy for youth employment and implement the Global Jobs Pact of the International Labour Organization

Goal 9. Build resilient infrastructure, promote inclusive and sustainable industrialization and foster innovation

9.1 Develop quality, reliable, sustainable and resilient infrastructure, including regional and transborder infrastructure, to support economic development and human well-being, with a focus on affordable and equitable access for all

9.2 Promote inclusive and sustainable industrialization and, by 2030, significantly raise industry's share of employment and gross domestic product, in line with national circumstances, and double its share in least developed countries

9.3 Increase the access of small-scale industrial and other enterprises, in particular in developing countries, to financial services, including affordable credit, and their integration into value chains and markets

9.4 By 2030, upgrade infrastructure and retrofit industries to make them sustainable, with increased resource-use efficiency and greater adoption of clean and environmentally sound technologies and industrial processes, with all countries taking action in accordance with their respective capabilities

9.5 Enhance scientific research, upgrade the technological capabilities of industrial sectors in all countries, in particular developing countries, including, by 2030, encouraging innovation and increasing the number of research and development workers per 1 million people by [x] per cent and public and private research and development spending

9.a Facilitate sustainable and resilient infrastructure development in developing countries through enhanced financial, technological and technical support to African countries, least developed countries, landlocked developing countries and small island developing States

9.b Support domestic technology development, research and innovation in developing countries, including by ensuring a conducive policy environment for, inter alia, industrial diversification and value addition to commodities

9.c Significantly increase access to information and communications technology and strive to provide universal and affordable access to the Internet in least developed countries by 2020

Goal 10. Reduce inequality within and among countries

10.1 By 2030, progressively achieve and sustain income growth of the bottom 40 per cent of the population at a rate higher than the national average

10.2 By 2030, empower and promote the social, economic and political inclusion of all, irrespective of age, sex, disability, race, ethnicity, origin, religion or economic or other status

10.3 Ensure equal opportunity and reduce inequalities of outcome, including by eliminating discriminatory laws, policies and practices and promoting appropriate legislation, policies and action in this regard

10.4 Adopt policies, especially fiscal, wage and social protection policies, and progressively achieve greater equality

10.5 Improve the regulation and monitoring of global financial markets and institutions and strengthen the implementation of such regulations

10.6 Ensure enhanced representation and voice for developing countries in decision-making in global international economic and financial institutions in order to deliver more effective, credible, accountable and legitimate institutions

10.7 Facilitate orderly, safe, regular and responsible migration and mobility of people, including through the implementation of planned and well-managed migration policies

10.a Implement the principle of special and differential treatment for developing countries, in particular least developed countries, in accordance with World Trade Organization agreements

10.b Encourage official development assistance and financial flows, including foreign direct investment, to States where the need is greatest, in particular least developed countries, African countries, small island developing States and

landlocked developing countries, in accordance with their national plans and programmes

10.c By 2030, reduce to less than 3 per cent the transaction costs of migrant remittances and eliminate remittance corridors with costs higher than 5 per cent

Goal 11. Make cities and human settlements inclusive, safe, resilient and sustainable

11.1 By 2030, ensure access for all to adequate, safe and affordable housing and basic services and upgrade slums

11.2 By 2030, provide access to safe, affordable, accessible and sustainable transport systems for all, improving road safety, notably by expanding public transport, with special attention to the needs of those in vulnerable situations, women, children, persons with disabilities and older persons

11.3 By 2030, enhance inclusive and sustainable urbanization and capacity for participatory, integrated and sustainable human settlement planning and management in all countries

11.4 Strengthen efforts to protect and safeguard the world's cultural and natural heritage

11.5 By 2030, significantly reduce the number of deaths and the number of people affected and decrease by [x] per cent the economic losses relative to gross domestic product caused by disasters, including water-related disasters, with a focus on protecting the poor and people in vulnerable situations

11.6 By 2030, reduce the adverse per capita environmental impact of cities, including by paying special attention to air quality and municipal and other waste management

11.7 By 2030, provide universal access to safe, inclusive and accessible, green and public spaces, in particular for women and children, older persons and persons with disabilities

11.a Support positive economic, social and environmental links between urban, peri-urban and rural areas by strengthening national and regional development planning

11.b By 2020, increase by [x] per cent the number of cities and human settlements adopting and implementing integrated policies and plans towards inclusion, resource efficiency, mitigation and adaptation to climate change, resilience to disasters, develop and implement, in line with the forthcoming Hyogo Framework, holistic disaster risk management at all levels

11.c Support least developed countries, including through financial and technical assistance, in building sustainable and resilient buildings utilizing local materials

Goal 12. Ensure sustainable consumption and production patterns

12.1 Implement the 10-year framework of programmes on sustainable consumption and production, all countries taking action, with developed countries taking the lead, taking into account the development and capabilities of developing countries

12.2 By 2030, achieve the sustainable management and efficient use of natural resources

12.3 By 2030, halve per capita global food waste at the retail and consumer levels and reduce food losses along production and supply chains, including post-harvest losses

12.4 By 2020, achieve the environmentally sound management of chemicals and all wastes throughout their life cycle, in accordance with agreed international frameworks, and significantly reduce their release to air, water and soil in order to minimize their adverse impacts on human health and the environment

12.5 By 2030, substantially reduce waste generation through prevention, reduction, recycling and reuse

12.6 Encourage companies, especially large and transnational companies, to adopt sustainable practices and to integrate sustainability information into their reporting cycle

12.7 Promote public procurement practices that are sustainable, in accordance with national policies and priorities

12.8 By 2030, ensure that people everywhere have the relevant information and awareness for sustainable development and lifestyles in harmony with nature

12.a Support developing countries to strengthen their scientific and technological capacity to move towards more sustainable patterns of consumption and production

12.b Develop and implement tools to monitor sustainable development impacts for sustainable tourism that creates jobs and promotes local culture and products

12.c Rationalize inefficient fossil-fuel subsidies that encourage wasteful consumption by removing market distortions, in accordance with national circumstances, including by restructuring taxation and phasing out those harmful subsidies, where they exist, to reflect their environmental impacts, taking fully into account the specific needs and conditions of developing countries and minimizing the possible adverse impacts on their development in a manner that protects the poor and the affected communities

Goal 13. Take urgent action to combat climate change and its impacts*

* Acknowledging that the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change is the primary international, intergovernmental forum for negotiating the global response to climate change.

13.1 Strengthen resilience and adaptive capacity to climate-related hazards and natural disasters in all countries

13.2 Integrate climate change measures into national policies, strategies and planning

13.3 Improve education, awareness-raising and human and institutional capacity on climate change mitigation, adaptation, impact reduction and early warning

13.a Implement the commitment undertaken by developed-country parties to the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change to a goal of mobilizing jointly $100 billion annually by 2020 from all sources to address the needs of developing countries in the context of meaningful mitigation actions and transparency on implementation and fully operationalize the Green Climate Fund through its capitalization as soon as possible

13.b Promote mechanisms for raising capacity for effective climate change-related planning and management in least developed countries, including focusing on women, youth and local and marginalized communities

Goal 14. Conserve and sustainably use the oceans, seas and marine resources for sustainable development

14.1 By 2025, prevent and significantly reduce marine pollution of all kinds, in particular from land-based activities, including marine debris and nutrient pollution

14.2 By 2020, sustainably manage and protect marine and coastal ecosystems to avoid significant adverse impacts, including by strengthening their resilience, and take action for their restoration in order to achieve healthy and productive oceans

14.3 Minimize and address the impacts of ocean acidification, including through enhanced scientific cooperation at all levels

14.4 By 2020, effectively regulate harvesting and end overfishing, illegal, unreported and unregulated fishing and destructive fishing practices and implement science-based management plans, in order to restore fish stocks in the shortest time feasible, at least to levels that can produce maximum sustainable yield as determined by their biological characteristics

14.5 By 2020, conserve at least 10 per cent of coastal and marine areas, consistent with national and international law and based on the best available scientific information

14.6 By 2020, prohibit certain forms of fisheries subsidies which contribute to overcapacity and overfishing, eliminate subsidies that contribute to illegal, unreported and unregulated fishing and refrain from introducing new such subsidies, recognizing that appropriate and effective special and differential treatment for developing and least developed countries should be an integral part of the World Trade Organization fisheries subsidies negotiation[4]

14.7 By 2030, increase the economic benefits to small island developing States and least developed countries from the sustainable use of marine resources, including through sustainable management of fisheries, aquaculture and tourism

14.a Increase scientific knowledge, develop research capacity and transfer marine technology, taking into account the Intergovernmental Oceanographic Commission Criteria and Guidelines on the Transfer of Marine Technology, in order to improve ocean health and to enhance the contribution of marine biodiversity to the development of developing countries, in particular small island developing States and least developed countries

[4] Taking into account ongoing World Trade Organization negotiations, the Doha Development Agenda and the Hong Kong ministerial mandate.

14.b Provide access for small-scale artisanal fishers to marine resources and markets

14.c Ensure the full implementation of international law, as reflected in the United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea for States parties thereto, including, where applicable, existing regional and international regimes for the conservation and sustainable use of oceans and their resources by their parties

Goal 15. Protect, restore and promote sustainable use of terrestrial ecosystems, sustainably manage forests, combat desertification, and halt and reverse land degradation and halt biodiversity loss

15.1 By 2020, ensure the conservation, restoration and sustainable use of terrestrial and inland freshwater ecosystems and their services, in particular forests, wetlands, mountains and drylands, in line with obligations under international agreements

15.2 By 2020, promote the implementation of sustainable management of all types of forests, halt deforestation, restore degraded forests and increase afforestation and reforestation by [x] per cent globally

15.3 By 2020, combat desertification, restore degraded land and soil, including land affected by desertification, drought and floods, and strive to achieve a land-degradation-neutral world

15.4 By 2030, ensure the conservation of mountain ecosystems, including their biodiversity, in order to enhance their capacity to provide benefits that are essential for sustainable development

15.5 Take urgent and significant action to reduce the degradation of natural habitats, halt the loss of biodiversity and, by 2020, protect and prevent the extinction of threatened species

15.6 Ensure fair and equitable sharing of the benefits arising from the utilization of genetic resources and promote appropriate access to such resources

15.7 Take urgent action to end poaching and trafficking of protected species of flora and fauna and address both demand and supply of illegal wildlife products

15.8 By 2020, introduce measures to prevent the introduction and significantly reduce the impact of invasive alien species on land and water ecosystems and control or eradicate the priority species

15.9 By 2020, integrate ecosystem and biodiversity values into national and local planning, development processes, poverty reduction strategies and accounts

15.a Mobilize and significantly increase financial resources from all sources to conserve and sustainably use biodiversity and ecosystems

15.b Mobilize significant resources from all sources and at all levels to finance sustainable forest management and provide adequate incentives to developing countries to advance such management, including for conservation and reforestation

15.c Enhance global support for efforts to combat poaching and trafficking of protected species, including by increasing the capacity of local communities to pursue sustainable livelihood opportunities

Goal 16. Promote peaceful and inclusive societies for sustainable development, provide access to justice for all and build effective, accountable and inclusive institutions at all levels

16.1 Significantly reduce all forms of violence and related death rates everywhere

16.2 End abuse, exploitation, trafficking and all forms of violence against and torture of children

16.3 Promote the rule of law at the national and international levels and ensure equal access to justice for all

16.4 By 2030, significantly reduce illicit financial and arms flows, strengthen the recovery and return of stolen assets and combat all forms of organized crime

16.5 Substantially reduce corruption and bribery in all their forms

16.6 Develop effective, accountable and transparent institutions at all levels

16.7 Ensure responsive, inclusive, participatory and representative decision-making at all levels

16.8 Broaden and strengthen the participation of developing countries in the institutions of global governance

16.9 By 2030, provide legal identity for all, including birth registration

16.10 Ensure public access to information and protect fundamental freedoms, in accordance with national legislation and international agreements

16.a Strengthen relevant national institutions, including through international cooperation, for building capacity at all levels, in particular in developing countries, to prevent violence and combat terrorism and crime

16.b Promote and enforce non-discriminatory laws and policies for sustainable development

Goal 17. Strengthen the means of implementation and revitalize the global partnership for sustainable development

Finance

17.1 Strengthen domestic resource mobilization, including through international support to developing countries, to improve domestic capacity for tax and other revenue collection

17.2 Developed countries to implement fully their official development assistance commitments, including to provide 0.7 per cent of gross national income in official development assistance to developing countries, of which 0.15 to 0.20 per cent should be provided to least developed countries

17.3 Mobilize additional financial resources for developing countries from multiple sources

17.4 Assist developing countries in attaining long-term debt sustainability through coordinated policies aimed at fostering debt financing, debt relief and debt restructuring, as appropriate, and address the external debt of highly indebted poor countries to reduce debt distress

17.5 Adopt and implement investment promotion regimes for least developed countries

Technology

17.6 Enhance North-South, South-South and triangular regional and international cooperation on and access to science, technology and innovation and enhance knowledge sharing on mutually agreed terms, including through improved coordination among existing mechanisms, in particular at the United Nations level, and through a global technology facilitation mechanism when agreed upon

17.7 Promote the development, transfer, dissemination and diffusion of environmentally sound technologies to developing countries on favourable terms, including on concessional and preferential terms, as mutually agreed

17.8 Fully operationalize the technology bank and science, technology and innovation capacity-building mechanism for least developed countries by 2017 and enhance the use of enabling technology, in particular information and communications technology

Capacity-building

17.9 Enhance international support for implementing effective and targeted capacity-building in developing countries to support national plans to implement all the sustainable development goals, including through North-South, South-South and triangular cooperation

Trade

17.10 Promote a universal, rules-based, open, non-discriminatory and equitable multilateral trading system under the World Trade Organization, including through the conclusion of negotiations under its Doha Development Agenda

17.11 Significantly increase the exports of developing countries, in particular with a view to doubling the least developed countries' share of global exports by 2020

17.12 Realize timely implementation of duty-free and quota-free market access on a lasting basis for all least developed countries, consistent with World Trade Organization decisions, including by ensuring that preferential rules of origin applicable to imports from least developed countries are transparent and simple, and contribute to facilitating market access

Systemic issues

Policy and institutional coherence

17.13 Enhance global macroeconomic stability, including through policy coordination and policy coherence

17.14 Enhance policy coherence for sustainable development

17.15 Respect each country's policy space and leadership to establish and implement policies for poverty eradication and sustainable development

Multi-stakeholder partnerships

17.16 Enhance the global partnership for sustainable development, complemented by multi-stakeholder partnerships that mobilize and share knowledge, expertise, technology and financial resources, to support the achievement of the sustainable development goals in all countries, in particular developing countries

17.17 Encourage and promote effective public, public-private and civil society partnerships, building on the experience and resourcing strategies of partnerships

Data, monitoring and accountability

17.18 By 2020, enhance capacity-building support to developing countries, including for least developed countries and small island developing States, to increase significantly the availability of high-quality, timely and reliable data disaggregated by income, gender, age, race, ethnicity, migratory status, disability, geographic location and other characteristics relevant in national contexts

17.19 By 2030, build on existing initiatives to develop measurements of progress on sustainable development that complement gross domestic product, and support statistical capacity-building in developing countries

Annex I to the note verbale dated 12 August 2014 from the Permanent Mission of Cuba to the United Nations addressed to the Secretary-General

[Original: Spanish]

Statement by Josefina Vidal Ferreiro, General Director for the United States Division of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs

Once again the Cuban Government's repeated complaints that the United States Government continues to carry out subversion plans against Cuba have been confirmed.

Further to an April 2014 report on the covert "Zunzuneo" project, the United States news agency Associated Press published an article on 4 August that documents another of these plans financed by the United States Agency for International Development (USAID) to negatively influence Cuban youth. This project, which the United States Government shamelessly admits having designed and implemented, attempted to politicize young Cubans previously identified by Latin American emissaries recruited for this purpose, and to organize them in opposition to the Cuban Government.

These facts confirm that the United States Government has not given up its hostile and interventionist Cuba strategy, to which it devotes millions of dollars every year in an attempt to create instability in order to bring about changes in our political system.

The United States Government must once and for all desist from all subversive, illegal and covert actions against Cuba, which violate our sovereignty and the express will of the Cuban people to perfect our economic and social model and strengthen our democracy.

Havana, 5 August 2014

Annex II to the note verbale dated 12 August 2014 from the Permanent Mission of Cuba to the United Nations addressed to the Secretary-General

[Original: Spanish]

Special communiqué regarding the new United States subversion plan in Cuba

The countries of the Bolivarian Alliance for the Peoples of Our America-Peoples' Trade Agreement (ALBA-TCP) have learned with indignation of the recent revelations by the United States news agency Associated Press about another subversion plan funded by the United States Agency for International Development (USAID).

That plan aimed to turn young Cubans into "social-change actors" and to organize them in opposition to the Cuban Government, using young Latin Americans recruited for that purpose since 2009.

This immoral project, which the United States Government has cynically admitted having designed and implemented, confirms the hostile and interventionist nature of United States policy towards Cuba and its intention to create instability leading to the overthrow of the political, economic and social order of our sister country.

ALBA-TCP condemns this new plan against Cuba and demands that the United States Government desist from such subversive, illegal and covert actions, which violate the Cuban people's sovereignty and right to self-determination.

The States members of ALBA-TCP express their deepest solidarity with the Republic of Cuba and demand that the United States Government respect the express will of the Cuban people to continue to perfect their economic and social model and strengthen their democracy, with no outside interference.

7 August 2014

United Nations A/68/972

General Assembly

Distr.: General
13 August 2014

Original: English

Sixty-eighth session
Agenda item 53
Comprehensive review of the whole question of peacekeeping operations in all their aspects

Letter dated 8 July 2014 from the Permanent Representatives of Australia and Uruguay to the United Nations addressed to the President of the General Assembly

We have the honour to write to you about the sixth workshop on the protection of civilians in United Nations peacekeeping operations, co-hosted by the Permanent Missions of Australia and Uruguay to the United Nations on 8 November 2013 in New York.

We consider that this was a very good opportunity to encourage an open, broad and constructive dialogue among Member States, peacekeepers from the field and the Secretariat about the policy, planning and preparedness issues in protecting civilians, as well as the additional steps that the Secretariat is continuing to take in order to improve the implementation of protection of civilians mandates.

A summary of the workshop discussion is attached (see annex). It describes briefly the main concerns, challenges and understandings raised by the various participants in this event.

We hope that this document will be helpful in discussions on these issues that could eventually take place in the General Assembly or its specialized body, the Special Committee on Peacekeeping Operations.

We request that the present letter and its annex be circulated to all Member States as a document of the General Assembly, under agenda item 53.

(*Signed*) Gary **Quinlan**

(*Signed*) Gonzalo **Koncke**

14-59122 (E) 120914

Please recycle

Annex to the letter dated 8 July 2014 from the Permanent Representatives of Australia and Uruguay to the United Nations addressed to the President of the General Assembly

Sixth workshop on the protection of civilians in United Nations peacekeeping, New York, 8 November 2013

1. The Permanent Missions of Australia and Uruguay to the United Nations co-hosted a workshop on the protection of civilians in United Nations peacekeeping operations on 8 November 2013. The workshop provided a forum for an exchange of views among Member States, peacekeepers from the field and the Secretariat to examine the policy, planning and preparedness gaps, as well as to analyse the emerging threats, challenges and opportunities in peacekeeping missions where protection of civilians is a priority task. A list of the panellists is attached (enclosure I).

2. This was the sixth in an ongoing series of workshops on protection of civilians co-hosted by the Permanent Missions of Australia and Uruguay to the United Nations. Previous workshops were held in January 2009 (see A/63/722), January 2010 (see A/64/721), December 2010 (see A/65/698), February 2012 (see A/66/789) and June 2012 (a summary of the fifth workshop is attached as enclosure II).

Background

3. Protection of civilians has become an integral part of modern United Nations peacekeeping operations and efforts to enhance protection of civilians have been reflected in the mandating and reauthorization of nine peacekeeping missions. In addition, several resolutions adopted by the Security Council in 2013 have drawn special attention to efforts by peacekeeping missions to protect civilians, in particular:

- Resolution 2086 (2013), the first thematic peacekeeping resolution to recognize the importance of protection of civilians as a mandated task in multidimensional peacekeeping operations
- Resolution 2106 (2013), in which the Council reiterated the call for all predeployment and in-mission training of troop and police contributors to include training on sexual and gender-based violence, as well as the deployment of women protection advisers
- Resolution 2117 (2013), the first resolution on small arms and light weapons, in which the Council recognized that the illicit transfer, destabilizing accumulation and misuse of small arms and light weapons fuel conflict and have an impact on protection of civilians and the implementation of peacekeeping mandates
- Resolution 2098 (2013), in which the Council authorized the United Nations Organization Mission in the Democratic Republic of the Congo (MONUSCO) to take all necessary measures through its regular forces and a newly established intervention brigade to protect civilians, neutralize armed groups and monitor the implementation of the arms embargo, among other tasks

4. In response to requests by the Special Committee on Peacekeeping Operations and the Security Council, over the past five years the Secretariat has worked with

troop- and police-contributing countries to develop (a) an operational concept on protection of civilians; (b) a framework to support the development of mission-specific strategies; (c) a resource and capability matrix; (d) an analysis of coordination mechanisms on protection of civilians; and (e) operational- and tactical-level training materials to support peacekeepers. These significant efforts address some of the challenges identified in the seminal independent study on protection of civilians commissioned by the Department of Peacekeeping Operations and the Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs in 2008.[a]

Session one
Assessing progress: closing the gaps in policy, planning and preparedness

5. At the first session the workshop examined the developments that had taken place to address the policy, planning and preparedness gaps on protection of civilians, focusing predominantly on the implementation of guidance and training that had been developed by the Secretariat to support peacekeeping missions to protect civilians as well as the recent establishment of a protection of civilians coordination team at Headquarters. The following key points were raised by panellists and workshop participants:

- **Effective and inclusive mission coordination mechanisms are crucial, and the most difficult ongoing challenge faced by missions is translating early warning into early response**. MONUSCO, for example, had established coordination mechanisms at several levels in the mission. That was also being supported by a package of innovative practices and tools, including a joint planning process (including with the host security forces), mission-wide processes to capture information on protection threats, and engagement with humanitarian protection actors to identify priority areas for protection.

- **Senior mission leadership is essential**. Mission leaders were best placed to mobilize resources and spearhead innovative approaches to protection. They were also well placed to identify different entry points within national institutions to enhance overall protection of civilians, and were often the only ones able to engage at the highest levels of government to mobilize rapid and coordinated responses to civilian threats.

- **Peacekeeping missions require an understanding of the threat as well as how to support communities**. Building networks within local communities was critical to such efforts. Community liaison assistants, community alert networks and joint protection teams in MONUSCO ensured that the mission could identify and understand the threats faced by communities and tailor its protection responses based on the needs of the local population. Those tools were established to bring civilian expertise to support military action for the protection of civilians through situational awareness and a focus on prevention through the development of community protection plans. The United Nations Mission in South Sudan (UNMISS) had examined many of the innovative approaches adopted by MONUSCO and was looking at ways to tailor them to the context in South Sudan.

[a] *Protecting Civilians in the Context of UN Peacekeeping Operations: Successes, Setbacks and Remaining Challenges* (United Nations publication, Sales No. E.10.III.M.1).

- **Protection of civilians advisers are effective**. In UNMISS, which presently had six protection of civilians advisers deployed, the advisers supported mission components to carry out the protection of civilians mandate and to mainstream protection of civilians throughout the missions, rather than actually undertaking protection. UNMISS had developed several mission-specific guidance documents, including standard operating procedures to implement the United Nations human rights due diligence policy and protection of civilians guidelines for when civilians sought protection at UNMISS bases, which had been a guidance gap.

- **Context-specific training is better**. The operational- and tactical-level training materials developed by the Department of Peacekeeping Operations provided several valuable scenarios for peacekeeping training centres and missions to draw on. However, coordination between the Integrated Training Service and Member States (through their peacekeeping training centres) could be further strengthened to improve the overall awareness about the training materials and support a more consistent and quality approach to protection of civilians training. Funding and sponsorship of peacekeeping training courses was an ongoing challenge.

Session two
Addressing emerging challenges: resolution 2098 (2013) and the future of protection of civilians in peacekeeping

6. At the second session the workshop analysed the threats, challenges and opportunities emerging from newly strengthened and protection of civilians-mandated peacekeeping missions, as well as the implications that the developments discussed at the first session would have for protection of civilians in peacekeeping. The second session focused primarily on MONUSCO and identified several concerns and lessons for future peacekeeping missions. The following key points were raised by panellists and workshop participants:

- **Context was everything**. A protection of civilians approach that was effective for one mission might not necessarily be effective for another.

- **The use of technology and greater use of radars would assist with improving overall situational awareness** and enhance a multitude of capabilities, potentially contributing to overall protection efforts and to enhancing the ability to identify threats to civilians and to respond quicker.

- **An ongoing challenge for missions was strengthening national ownership and leadership for protection of civilians**. In MONUSCO, an essential priority remained creation of a rapid reaction force (comprised of national forces) to enable a gradual takeover of some of the responsibilities of MONUSCO for security and protection of civilians. Further steps were also required by the Democratic Republic of the Congo under the Peace, Security and Cooperation Framework to address the root causes of the conflict by advancing key reforms, especially those aimed at bringing a lasting improvement in the security situation and living conditions of the local population.

- **There were concerns about the implications of the use of force through offensive actions by the MONUSCO Force Intervention Brigade, and the approach presented opportunities as well as risks**. The Brigade had been an effective mechanism for MONUSCO to clearly enable offensive military operations and to seize the initiative by taking a proactive and pre-emptive stance. The threat of force, and not just its use, was enabling the mission to gain the psychological edge, resulting in a changed dynamic on the ground and improving overall efforts to provide protection to civilians in eastern Democratic Republic of the Congo. It was also enabling more leverage over the national forces and influencing their behaviour, and building capacity to protect the civilian population.

- **The Force Intervention Brigade also presented risks**, including of civilian harm in the conduct of operations, or of retaliation by the armed groups against MONUSCO and the civilian populations. Also, where the mission was perceived as a party to conflict, there was a risk that humanitarian actors working alongside it would not be perceived as neutral, impartial and independent, which could undermine their access to communities. Thus, a more visible distinction between the mission and humanitarian actors might be needed. The more robust the posture, the more perception became an issue.

- **The establishment of the new United Nations Multidimensional Integrated Stabilization Mission in Mali (MINUSMA) had raised similar questions regarding the use of force in a hostile environment where peacekeepers were confronted with asymmetric threats and terrorist activity**. Threats such as these and the significant proliferation of small arms presented emerging challenges for peacekeepers that were mandated to protect civilians.

- **Despite recent successes in MONUSCO, the expectations of the civilian population needed to be managed, and mission coordination structures remained essential to ensure consistency across the mission**.

Conclusions

7. There had been great strides on protection of civilians over the past five years, particularly as regards the normative framework. However, challenges and gaps remained, and ongoing attention was required to support continued efforts to assist peacekeeping missions to protect civilians, particularly in areas such as lessons emerging from best practice in the field (including through the use of protection of civilians advisers), host country ownership and leadership, and engaging senior leadership on protection of civilians priorities. In particular, there needed to be a collective improvement in responding to protection of civilians threats, predominantly through the provision of resources and capabilities, both at Headquarters and in the field. It was the consensus of the workshop that all protection of civilians stakeholders needed to focus on the effectiveness of mission in the field in order to bring about change for local populations.

Enclosure I

Programme of the workshop and list of participants

Opening and welcome

- Gary Quinlan, Ambassador and Permanent Representative of Australia to the United Nations
- José Luis Cancela, Ambassador and Permanent Representative of Uruguay to the United Nations

Session one
Assessing progress: closing the gaps in policy, planning and preparedness

Panellists:

- Leila Zerrougui, Special Representative of the Secretary-General for Children and Armed Conflict; Former Deputy Special Representative of the Secretary-General, MONUSCO
- Robert Kabage, Director, International Peace Support Training Centre, Kenya
- Damian Lilly, Senior Protection of Civilians Adviser and Coordinator, UNMISS

Discussant:

- Eiko Ikegaya, Deputy Chief, Policy and Best Practices Service, Department of Peacekeeping Operations

Session two
Addressing emerging challenges: resolution 2098 (2013) and the future of protection of civilians in peacekeeping

Panellists:

- Adrian Foster, Deputy Military Adviser, Department of Peacekeeping Operations
- Masood Khan, Ambassador and Permanent Representative, Permanent Mission of Pakistan to the United Nations, Chair of the Security Council Working Group on Peacekeeping Operations
- Hansjoerg Strohmeyer, Director, Policy Development and Studies Branch, Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs

Enclosure II

Fifth workshop on the protection of civilians in peacekeeping operations, New York, 13 June 2012

1. The Permanent Missions of Australia and Uruguay to the United Nations and the International Peace Institute co-hosted a half-day workshop entitled "Protection of civilians in peacekeeping operations: capacity-building and transitions" on 13 June 2012. The month of June 2012 was an important one for the protection of civilians agenda in the United Nations, with the release of the latest report of the Secretary-General on protection of civilians in armed conflict and an open debate on the topic in the Security Council on 25 June. Ahead of that important debate, the half-day workshop gathered a range of actors, including practitioners, United Nations officials, representatives of host Governments and humanitarian and civil society organizations to explore some of the key issues related to efforts to strengthen the long-term capacity of host countries to protect civilians. The two panels of the workshop focused on the experiences in Haiti, Liberia and the Democratic Republic of the Congo. The workshop was the fifth of the series co-hosted by the Permanent Missions of Australia and Uruguay, which began in January 2009.

Background

2. Improving the protection of civilians by United Nations peacekeeping operations has been the focus of much research, debate and work in recent years. In this context, the Secretary-General has identified a core remaining challenge as "proactive, well-trained and appropriately resourced peacekeepers who can use a full spectrum of tools — military, police, justice, corrections and human rights — in a cohesive fashion". As efforts progress to equip peacekeeping missions with the proper resources, tools and guidance to better protect civilians, comparatively little consideration has been given by the protection of civilians community to the second part of this core challenge identified by the Secretary-General, namely that "peacekeeping missions and other partners must continue to strengthen national institutions so that they are able to discharge their primary responsibility for enhancing security and the rule of law by the time the mission leaves".

3. As the Secretary-General points out, the protection of civilians activities of the United Nations are broad in scope and must be thought of as including efforts to support the host Government to fulfil its responsibility for protecting civilians. A peace operation cannot exist forever, and protection of civilians will be sustained in the long run only through strengthening national capacities and legitimate institutions. Recent research, however, suggests that building such capacity (in the form of transformed institutions that are effective, trusted and resilient) is a more difficult and much longer process than previously understood, requiring at least a generation to be successful.

4. In this effort, the United Nations, even with its numerous offices, agencies and programmes, is only one actor among many others. Capacity-building efforts, especially in areas such as security sector reform and the rule of law, involve an array of stakeholders: bilateral donors, non-governmental organizations and humanitarian actors, regional organizations and, most importantly, the host country, its Government, its civil society and its people. Ensuring national ownership,

coherence and common purpose in this context are significant challenges. At present, with a number of United Nations peacekeeping mission drawdowns or reconfigurations expected in the near future, ensuring protection of civilians in the medium to long term is particularly critical.

Session one
Building capacities for sustainable civilian protection: strengthening national institutions

5. At the first session the workshop focused on strengthening the capacity of national institutions to protect civilians. All panellists recognized that the protection of civilians was the primary responsibility of the host Government. In order to make protection of civilians sustainable, therefore, the panellists argued for the need to focus on the long-term challenges of building the host countries' capacities to protect civilians. However, this should be done without diminishing the importance of the immediate protection of civilians tasks of the mission. In the case of the United Nations Organization Mission in the Democratic Republic of the Congo (MONUSCO), those efforts were prioritized as follows: first, to reduce and, to the extent possible, eliminate the threat that armed groups represented to the protection of civilians; and second, to support building the capability of State institutions to deal with whatever threat remained. The need to bridge the gap between those two tasks — immediate threats to the protection of civilians and contributing to building national institutions — was underscored. The mission could help bridge the gap by actively working hand in hand with national institutions while responding to immediate threats to the protection of civilians. That required strong coordination between the police, military and civilian capacities of the mission, as well as a continued focus on ensuring that peacekeepers were prepared with the proper training and guidance to undertake that role.

6. Tasks such as security sector reform, disarmament, demobilization and reintegration and the strengthening of rule of law institutions were central to the protection of civilians in the long term. However, as one panellist noted, often in such post-conflict contexts, the problem with the national security sector was not a lack of capacity to employ force, but a lack of oversight mechanisms to control its use. In such countries, the security sector was originally created in order to protect the regime in power, rather than to serve the people. The institutions were never part of an organic social contract with the population, and because the shadow of that legacy still existed, there was a need not to reform the institutions, but to transform them. The international community must help establish mechanisms for governance and oversight of the security sector. That would help ensure that the civilian population had confidence in the security sector, a point also emphasized at session two in the context of Haiti. The panellists stressed the role of the leadership in promoting the concept of protection of civilians. The military needed to have professional officers who had the right outlook and approach. The Liberian national police provided an example of their attempt to increase professionalism by increasing the number of college graduates in the police force and excluding those who were committing crimes.

7. National police played a particularly important role in protecting civilians. In the Democratic Republic of the Congo, training and mentoring the national police as well as the armed forces was the cornerstone of the strategy to ultimately replace the functions of the United Nations mission there. Yet, to support that capacity more

needed to be done to ensure that peacekeeping missions had the right kind of skill sets to undertake such training and mentoring. Deployable civilian capacity, as well as experts who had the ability to transfer skills as trainers, were vital. South-South cooperation could play a key role where, for example, the States of the region had relevant capacities, including an understanding of the context, as well as linguistic skills.

8. Panellists and participants stressed that women's participation in the missions as well as in the security sector was critical, as women brought distinctive perspectives and skills, acted as role models and were best placed to engage with much of the population. The national police also needed to improve how they focused specifically on the protection of women. In Liberia, specialized police units that included women and children sections and gender sections as well as community watch teams had positive impacts on the protection of civilians. Participants argued that there was a need to share best practices between missions. Inspired by Liberia, MONUSCO was planning its own all-female police contingent. Liberia was also a role model for women's leadership and inclusion in the security sector, and the Democratic Republic of the Congo now had its first female Minister of Justice.

9. The panellists further highlighted the importance of an integrated and holistic approach to United Nations support to institution-building. This included support to both the economic and social infrastructure, such as the building of roads that would enable protection of civilians, as well as the expansion of telecommunications networks to strengthen community alert systems. Increased outreach and contact with the local population would also lead to a better understanding of local protection challenges. In both the United Nations Mission in Liberia (UNMIL) and MONUSCO, programmes had been developed to ensure effective communication with the local population, but there was still room for improvement.

10. Panellists were asked about the challenges to making the security sector more legitimate, particularly with regard to the integration of former combatants into the army or police. In both the Democratic Republic of the Congo and Liberia, the panellists admitted that integration produced as many problems as solutions and the way in which the process took place might need serious rethinking. It was again suggested that a social contract should be negotiated to help transform the mentality of the security sector and to develop a common vision for their society.

11. The discussion highlighted the wide range of actors involved in such work beyond peacekeepers, including United Nations funds and programmes, bilateral and regional partners and civil society organizations. Coordination between those actors and an effective dialogue with the host country was pivotal and still needed to be improved. The panellists expressed the hope that those efforts would have an impact with regard to more effective partnerships beyond the lifespan of the mission. The need to have consistent and predictable funding and ongoing dialogue with partners to support financing of programmes was also noted. Such consistent dialogue was essential to resolving the fundamental tension between the relatively short-term lens of peacekeeping and the long-term need for the protection of civilians.

Session two

Building capacities for sustainable civilian protection: towards transition in Haiti

12. The second panel focused on the specific challenges of building capacities for sustainable civilian protection in Haiti. Two areas of national institution-building were given special attention: strengthening the capacity of the national police to provide physical protection; and strengthening the rule of law, the judiciary and civil administration systems to protect legal and human rights and to contribute to overall stability.

13. At present, sexual and gender-based violence was still one of the main physical threats to civilians. The large number of internally displaced persons living in temporary camps contributed to the high levels of sexual and gender-based violence and in the aftermath of the earthquake, not enough was done to ensure that camps were designed with the protection of civilians in mind.

14. The Haitian national police, for its part, had never developed a culture of protection of civilians. A change of mindset, whereby all officers would take sexual and gender-based violence equally seriously, was needed and was slowly being implemented. The national police was in the process of creating a specialized unit to respond to violence against women, and the United Nations Stabilization Mission in Haiti (MINUSTAH) had provided strong support in that regard. In general, MINUSTAH had a better image within Haiti than was assumed, and the cooperation between the Haitian national police and United Nations police had been very positive. The Haitian national police continued to take on a greater role in protecting civilians in Haiti. Immediately following the earthquake of January 2010, the police force was said to be the only functioning entity of the Government, yet it was still no match for the challenge it faced. Crime rates after the earthquake, which had initially increased (owing in part to the escape of thousands of prisoners from the main prison), had steadily decreased as the capacity of the Haitian national police had improved. However, the effective protection of civilians was still hampered by the lack of access to justice, coupled with a relatively low level of confidence in the security institutions. To address the latter, MINUSTAH had played an important role in providing support to the national police, and it had been suggested that the United Nations should be tasked with helping facilitate a new social contract between Haitian security institutions and the Haitian people.

15. The most persistent challenge to the sustainable protection of civilians in Haiti continued to be a stark lack of capacity in the justice and corrections systems. Many cases of sexual and gender-based violence were not reported to the police, and even fewer made it to trial. In one analysis, 640 cases of reported violence were tracked and not one was seen to have made it through to the sentencing phase of a trial. Prisons were few, notoriously overcrowded and filled primarily with those still awaiting trial. Therefore, the Haitian people continued to distrust the security institutions as a whole. As the head of the Haitian national police stated, "without progress on the judicial system, Haiti will go nowhere".

16. Access to land and ambiguity about land ownership were also major concerns in Haiti. About 420,000 internally displaced persons were still living in 600 makeshift settlements, many on private land. That figure was down from a high of 1.5 million following the earthquake, but the remaining group continued to be the most vulnerable. In addition to the prevalence of sexual and gender-based violence cited above, the lingering presence of internally displaced persons had led in recent

months to an increasing number of forced evictions by landowners, often with violence. The United Nations Human Settlements Programme was working with the Ministry of Land and Reconstruction to promote land reform, but the issue of internally displaced persons and land rights in general remained a particularly vexing challenge. In particular, the laws had been amended so often that it was not uncommon for several people to hold a title for the same piece of land.

17. In that connection, the panellists also highlighted the need for the international community to support the work on improving civil administration. In Haiti more than 30 per cent of the population lacked birth registration, which led to their being cut off to a large degree from the State and denied many basic civil rights. Those issues shed light on the need for a comprehensive effort to strengthen all parts of national institutions, including civil rights and administrative systems.

18. Given the remaining challenges facing civilians in Haiti and the vast needs of its national institutions, it was emphasized by all panellists that any transition undergone by MINUSTAH needed to be reasonable, realistic and careful. Following the withdrawal of the post-earthquake surge capacity, there must be a well-considered consolidation plan that was realistic both in its assessment of the state of the Haitian security, justice and civil administration institutions, as well as in terms of the time and effort that would be required to ensure that those institutions were capable of protecting all Haitian civilians once MINUSTAH had come to an end.

Conclusion

19. Regarding transitions, it was clear that the planning for full handover of protection of civilians responsibilities needed to begin very early, given the long-term commitment needed to build the capacity of rule of law and security institutions. The process should emphasize national capacity development, and there needed to be broad national ownership as well as strong coordination with bilateral, regional and multilateral partners. Transition processes therefore needed to allow for flexibility and be adaptable to change along the way. In the end, there was still a need for more information and analysis on how to measure the readiness of rule of law and security institutions to assume full responsibility for the protection of civilians.

Attachment

Programme of the fifth workshop and list of participants

Welcome: Adam C. Smith, Research Fellow, International Peace Institute

Session one
Building capacities for sustainable civilian protection: strengthening national institutions

Chair: Gary Quinlan, Ambassador and Permanent Representative of Australia to the United Nations

Presenters:

- Roger Meece, Special Representative of the Secretary-General, MONUSCO
- Rose Stryker, Deputy Police Director for Administration, Liberia national police

Discussant:

- Adedeji Ebo, Chief, Security Sector Reform Unit, Department of Peacekeeping Operations

Session two
Building capacities for sustainable civilian protection: towards transition in Haiti

Chair: José Luis Cancela, Ambassador and Permanent Representative of Uruguay to the United Nations

Presenters:

- Mario Andresol, Chief, Haitian national police
- Vincent Cochetel, Regional Representative, United States and the Caribbean, Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees
- William Gardner, Integrated Operational Team Leader for Haiti, Department of Peacekeeping Operations